Clinical value of the measurement of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* specific antibody in pulmonary tuberculosis

G H Bothamley, R Rudd, F Festenstein, J Ivanyi

**Abstract**

**Background** A serological test that could help to diagnose tuberculosis, especially smear negative disease, would contribute to patient management.

**Methods** Levels of antibody to distinct antigens of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* were assessed for their value in the diagnosis and management of pulmonary tuberculosis. Serum was taken from 52 patients who were smear positive, from 27 patients who were smear negative but with evidence of active tuberculosis (sputum culture positive in 16, response to antituberculosis chemotherapy in 11), from 11 patients with old healed tuberculosis (pre-antibiotic era), and from 39 healthy subjects vaccinated with BCG.

**Results** In smear positive tuberculosis an enzyme linked immunosorbent assay using a single 38 kDa antigen gave a diagnostic sensitivity of 80% with a 100% specificity. In smear negative pulmonary tuberculosis, however, combination of the 19 kDa antigen, lipoarabinomannan (ML 34 epitope), and hsp65 (TB 70 epitope) was needed to achieve a sensitivity of 64% with a specificity of 95%. Recurrent and extensive radiographic disease with a poor prognosis was associated with high anti-38 kDa and low anti-14 kDa antibody levels in patients with active disease. Patients with less pulmonary cavitation had high anti-19 kDa titres. Bacteriological relapse during treatment was indicated by a rise in anti-14 kDa (TB68 epitope) antibodies. Four patients with non-tuberculous mycobacterial infection showed no anti-38 kDa antibody.

**Conclusion** Antigen or epitope specific serology may help in the diagnosis, assessment of prognosis, and monitoring of chemotherapy in patients with pulmonary tuberculosis.

Tuberculosis remains an important health problem in the United Kingdom.\(^1\) The decline in incidence has slowed\(^2\) and diagnosis has become more difficult because of atypical presentations and a lack of familiarity with the disease among doctors.\(^3\) The mortality from tuberculosis has remained constant for the past decade at about 10%\(^4\) (A Fenton-Lewis, personal communication). The diagnosis of tuberculosis is readily made when a sputum smear contains acid fast bacilli. Subsequent culture will usually identify those patients with tuberculosis and those infected with other mycobacterial species after a delay of three to nine weeks. Clinical features that identify patients with a risk of greater morbidity include increasing age, alcoholism, neutrophilia and lymphopenia, and delayed diagnosis.\(^5\) Severe or extensive disease is associated with a reduced tuberculin response.\(^6\) Short course chemotherapy for tuberculosis still lasts for six months and poor compliance with treatment is a common problem.\(^7\) A serological test capable of diagnosing smear negative tuberculosis, and also cases in which sputum is difficult to obtain, would be very helpful.

The usefulness of determining antibodies in tuberculosis has been largely dismissed since Mitchison et al\(^8\) could not reproduce the results of one such assay.\(^9\) Serological tests using crude antigens derived from tubercle bacilli have been unsuccessful owing to the broad cross reactivity of mycobacterial antigens.\(^10\) This problem has been overcome by the development of monoclonal antibodies that recognise antigenic determinants or epitopes specific for the *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex.\(^11\) These monoclonal antibodies have been used to measure levels of antibody to specific epitopes\(^12\) to purified antigens for use in diagnostic assays.\(^13\) This study examined the diagnostic value of *M. tuberculosis* specific antibody and its association with the extent of disease, prognosis, and compliance with chemotherapy to investigate whether serological tests might have a role in the management of patients with pulmonary tuberculosis.

**Methods**

**PATIENTS**

1. Serum was obtained from 56 patients with acid fast bacilli detected in their sputum before the start of treatment; in 52 patients *M. tuberculosis* was cultured from sputum, six strains being resistant to isoniazid. In four patients non-tuberculous mycobacteria were identified. Fourteen of the smear positive patients had had tuberculosis before but had been free from disease for at least two years before the present episode. Thirty one of the patients with a positive smear were followed during treatment and serum samples were obtained seven, 14,
Clinical value of the measurement of Mycobacterium tuberculosis specific antibody in pulmonary tuberculosis

ENZYME LINKED IMMUNOSORBENT ASSAY WITH PURIFIED ANTIGENS

The 14, 19, and 38 kDa antigens were purified by affinity chromatography, with the monoclonal antibodies TB68, TB23, and TB71.19 The 65 kDa antigen, a recombinant protein, and lipoarabinomannan were also used. Microtitre plates (Immulon M129, Dynatech) were coated with 50 μl of 0-2 μg/ml 14 or 19 kDa antigens, 0-35 μg/ml 38 kDa antigen, 1 μg/ml 65 kDa antigen, 0-1 μg/ml lipoarabinomannan or with phosphate buffered saline overnight at 4°C. Non-specific binding was blocked with phosphate buffered saline containing 0-05% Tween 20 (Sigma Chemical Company, Poole, Dorset) and 1% skimmed milk (Sainsbury PLC: PBSTM). Fifty microlitres of four dilutions of serum (1:5, 1:25, 1:125, and 1:625) in PBSTM were incubated for one hour at 37°C. Duplicate wells and after repeated washing 50 μl of goat anti-human IgG peroxidase conjugate (Bio-Rad Laboratories) diluted 1:3000 were incubated for one hour at 37°C. After washing, bound peroxidase activity was measured with 0-1 μg/ml tetramethylbenzidine in 0-1 M citrate buffer pH 5-1 containing 0-01% hydrogen peroxide (v/v) for 10 minutes, the reaction being stopped by the addition of 0-5 M sulphuric acid. Optical densities were measured at 450 nm and the antibody titre was calculated as that dilution of serum giving 30% of the plateau of a standard hyperimmune serum (ABTm).

STATISTICAL ANALYSIS

Comparisons between groups were made by using the Mann-Whitney U test. Antibody titres and clinical measures were compared by means of the Spearman rank correlation test.

Results

DIAGNOSTIC VALUE OF SEROLOGY

Patients with smear positive pulmonary tuberculosis had raised titres of antibody to all the antigens and epitopes tested, but the response in smear negative disease was more restricted (table 1). The frequencies of positive titres of antibody in smear positive and smear negative patients to the 19 kDa antigen (61% and 58%) and ML34 epitope (54% and 32%) did not differ (table 1; χ² = 0-01 and 2-6, p > 0-1). A combination of positive titres of antibody to these two antigenic determinants and to the TB78 epitope gave the best diagnostic sensitivity in patients with smear negative pulmonary tuberculosis (table 2). A positive antibody titre in patients with smear negative, culture positive pulmonary tuberculosis was obtained on average 36 (median 33, range 19–
Table 1 Antibody titres in controls and patients with pulmonary tuberculosis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Antigen or epitope</th>
<th>Controls (n = 39)</th>
<th>Self healed (n = 11)</th>
<th>Smear negative (n = 27)</th>
<th>Smear positive (n = 52)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14 kDa</td>
<td>1 (0-3); 5</td>
<td>23 (6-43); 36</td>
<td>25 (1-40); **; 46</td>
<td>78 (12-241); **; 72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB68</td>
<td>4 (3-6); 0</td>
<td>6 (5-11); 11</td>
<td>6 (3-12); 11</td>
<td>14 (9-21); **; 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 kDa</td>
<td>0 (0-4); 3</td>
<td>11 (0-49); 55</td>
<td>12 (2-25); **; 58</td>
<td>41 (4-106); **; 61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB23</td>
<td>6 (3-9); 0</td>
<td>8 (4-9); 0</td>
<td>5 (3-12); 4</td>
<td>17 (8-36); **; 46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38 kDa</td>
<td>0 (0-0); 0</td>
<td>0 (0-0); 9</td>
<td>0 (0-0); 15</td>
<td>60 (12-287); **; 83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB71</td>
<td>1 (0-2); 0</td>
<td>2 (1-2); 0</td>
<td>2 (1-4); **; 11</td>
<td>7 (2-26); **; 56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB72</td>
<td>2 (1-4); 3</td>
<td>4 (1-5); 0</td>
<td>5 (2-8); 18</td>
<td>24 (8-67); **; 73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65 kDa</td>
<td>79 (23-181); 0</td>
<td>317 (37-514); 18</td>
<td>107 (19-290); 0</td>
<td>172 (71-566); **; 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB78</td>
<td>0 (0-1); 0</td>
<td>1 (0-4); 18</td>
<td>1 (0-4); 14</td>
<td>3 (1-5); **; 48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAM (IgM)</td>
<td>48 (3-127); 0</td>
<td>9 (0-307); 0</td>
<td>69 (31-440); 19</td>
<td>1013 (165-3125); **; 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LAM (IgG)</td>
<td>10 (0-25); 0</td>
<td>0 (0-12); 0</td>
<td>29 (4-63); **; 0</td>
<td>34 (7-108); **; 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ML34</td>
<td>15 (10-20); 3</td>
<td>18 (14-30); 11</td>
<td>18 (12-46); **; 32</td>
<td>41 (25-126); **; 54</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Patients were compared with controls by the Mann-Whitney U test: *p < 0-01; **p < 0-001.
†Antibodies to purified antigens were IgG unless indicated otherwise; antibodies to individual epitopes were not class specific.
‡Positive titres were defined as > log mean + 2SD of control values.

63) days before the results of culture were available.

Although the frequencies of positive titres of antibody to the 38 kDa antigen and its TB72 epitope did not differ, the use of lipoparabinomannan as a diagnostic reagent gave poorer results than the ML34 competition test (table 1). More than half (54%) the patients with smear negative tuberculosis had an IgM antibody titre greater than the titre of IgG antibody to lipoparabinomannan, compared with 20% of those with smear positive disease ($\chi^2 = 5.5, p = 0.04$).

### Extent and Severity of Disease

#### Survival

Four deaths occurred in patients with smear positive pulmonary tuberculosis, tuberculosis being the main cause in three. Titres of antibody to the TB71 epitope (38 kDa antigen) were greater ($r = 3.04, p = 0.03$) and of IgG antibody to the 14 kDa antigen were lower ($r = -3.26, p = 0.03$) in the four who died than in survivors (figure).

No patient was identified as being likely to die from tuberculosis on the basis of clinical criteria, though a more unfavourable score was associated with lower anti lipoparabinomannan IgM antibody ($r = 0.43, p = 0.002, \rho_{corr} = 0.03$). Alcoholism and increasing age were associated with death ($\chi^2 = 8.75, p < 0.01$ and 0.002 respectively): 15 patients with smear positive tuberculosis were over 65 or had an alcohol problem and three of these died during treatment. Serological criteria (TB71 titre > 25, or < 25 with a titre of < 11 for the 14 kDa antigen), however, would have been significantly better than clinical criteria for predicting mortality ($\chi^2 = 5.6, p = 0.02$).

#### Radiographic extent of disease

Despite the crude scoring of the extent of radiographic disease there were correlations with anti-38 kDa antibody levels in smear positive tuberculosis ($r = 0.39, p = 0.005, \rho_{corr} = 0.049$) and with anti-19 kDa and anti lipoparabinomannan antibody titres in smear negative disease (for both $r = 0.50, p = 0.004, \rho_{corr} = 0.039$). There was a negative correlation between cavitation and titres of antibody to the 19 kDa antigen ($r = -0.32, p = 0.017, \rho_{corr} = 0.05$) in those with smear positive tuberculosis.

Table 2 Serodiagnostic potential of Mycobacterium tuberculosis specific reagents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Test</th>
<th>Sensitivity (%)</th>
<th>Specificity (%)</th>
<th>Predictive value* (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>SMEAR POSITIVE PULMONARY TUBERCULOSIS</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smear</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>71 100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chest radiograph†</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>93 94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tuberculin†</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>43 98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38 kDa antigen</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100 97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB72 epitope</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100 96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Six epitopes</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>62 99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SMEAR NEGATIVE PULMONARY TUBERCULOSIS</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38 kDa antigen</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100 90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 kDa antigen</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>74 95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ML34 epitope</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100 92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 kDa/ML34/TB78</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>65 96</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Predictive values have been calculated with Toman's formulae and data from the London Chest Hospital, where 1462 individuals were culture positive for M tuberculosis out of 11 455 patients tested during 1969-88.
†Data from Toman.21
‡Data from Chaparas et al.22


Previous disease

Patients who had a recurrence of tuberculosis had higher titres of antibody to both epitopes (TB71 and TB72) of the 38 kDa antigen than patients with their first infection with tuberculosis (p = 0.01 and 0.03 respectively). In contrast, patients with old (pre-antibiotic) healed tuberculosis that had been smear negative for more than 40 years had high titres of antibody to the 14 and 19 kDa antigens (Table 1) and showed a negative correlation between the area of pulmonary scarring visible on the chest radiograph and titres of antibody to the 14 kDa antigen (r = -0.75, p = 0.007, Pcorr = 0.048).

ANTIBODY TITRES AND TREATMENT IN SMEAR POSITIVE TUBERCULOSIS

Culture positivity during treatment

After two months of antituberculous chemotherapy sputum samples from most patients were smear and culture negative; in four patients with extensive pulmonary cavitation a positive smear persisted for up to four months but culture for M tuberculosis was negative after two months; thus treatment was effective in all patients. In five patients a positive culture occurred during treatment after a period of negative cultures. There was no change in the antibiotic sensitivities of the cultured organism in any of these cases, suggesting that the patient had failed to continue treatment. All five patients, none of whom had a positive antibody titre for the TB68 epitope of the 14 kDa antigen when they had become smear and culture negative, developed a positive titre of antibody to this epitope at the time that the culture positive sputum was obtained. Titres of antibody to the TB68 epitope were significantly greater in those who became culture positive than in those who did not during the same periods (Table 3).

isoniazid resistance

Isoniazid resistant strains of M tuberculosis were grown from six patients, four of whom had recurrent tuberculosis. Titres of antibody to all the epitopes except for TB23 rose more slowly after treatment in these patients than in those from whom fully sensitive strains were cultured; significant differences were observed at two weeks (in all cases t < -2.3, p < 0.04).

Titres of antibody to the TB72 epitope of the 38 kDa protein at two weeks had fallen below pretreatment levels in all subjects with isoniazid resistant strains, a fall that occurred in only two patients with fully sensitive strains of M tuberculosis (χ² = 4.2, p = 0.04).

Non-tuberculous mycobacteria

Four patients were infected with atypical mycobacteria (one with M avium-intracellulare, one with M kansasii, and two with M xenopi). One patient had a myeloma, but the other three had no evidence of immunosuppression and all were negative for HIV antigen and antibody. Two patients had weakly positive titres of antibody (2–3 SD above the log mean of control values—to the TB68 and TB78 epitopes respectively) at the start of treatment; none was positive for the TB71 and TB72 epitopes of the 38 kDa antigen. No patient with atypical mycobacterial infection had a positive titre of antibody to any of the six epitopes two weeks after treatment had begun.

Discussion

This study has shown that M tuberculosis restricted antigens can be used in the serological diagnosis of pulmonary tuberculosis. The serological test was as sensitive as but more specific than the use of tuberculin and could distinguish non-tuberculous mycobacterial disease from tuberculosis by the absence of anti-38 kDa antibody and no rise in levels of antibody to other M tuberculosis specific epitopes and could detect patients with smear negative pulmonary tuberculosis before the results of sputum culture were available. In smear positive pulmonary tuberculosis, most patients had high titres of antibody to the 38 kDa antigen, confirming the results of previous studies.18-19 23-24 The 38 kDa antigen is also contained in the antigen 5 preparation25-26 and is of value in serological diagnosis and screening for infectious tuberculosis.27-32 Serological tests in smear negative pulmonary tuberculosis have been disappointing.33-37 Our study is the first to show that a combination of antigens can achieve a sensitivity in smear negative pulmonary tuberculosis similar to that
of tuberculin testing but with greater specificity.

The use of monoclonal antibodies is an advance in the serological diagnosis of tuberculosis because they are readily prepared in a standard form, are free from the problems of cross reactivity, permit the measurement of both IgM and IgG antibodies in a single assay, and obviate the need to purify antigens from *M tuberculosis*. Indeed, the TB72 competition assay fared as well as the use of purified 38 kDa antigen in the serodiagnosis of smear positive tuberculosis. An ELISA modification of the competition assay\(^6\) can give a result in four hours with precoated plates and has been used successfully in the diagnosis of extrapulmonary tuberculosis.\(^7\) The cost of such an assay would be similar to that of an autoantibody screen. In smear negative pulmonary tuberculosis, however, purified 19 kDa antigen will be needed until the epitope, which is not that defined by the MAB TB23, has been identified.

High titres of antibody to the 38 kDa antigen were associated with more extensive and recurrent tuberculosis and increased mortality as well as being largely confined to those with smear positive disease whereas antibody to the 14 kDa antigen was associated with a good prognosis and less radiographic infiltration in patients with self healed pulmonary tuberculosis (table 4). Antibody titres for these two antigens were more successful than a scoring system based on clinical criteria,\(^6\) or the factors of advanced age and alcoholism, in predicting who would be at greatest risk from tuberculosis. Inpatient treatment of tuberculosis is increasingly rare and the identification of patients at greatest risk would be valuable in deciding which patients require hospital admission.

The treatment of tuberculosis is necessarily prolonged and compliance is a problem. This study suggests that titres of antibody to the TB68 epitope of the 14 kDa antigen could be used to monitor compliance by indicating those who had become culture positive again; such patients might then electively receive supervised chemotherapy. Isoniazid resistant strains of *M tuberculosis* were associated with a failure of antibody titres to rise after two weeks’ treatment; adding other drugs to the standard regimen of rifampicin, isoniazid, and pyrazino-amiide could be considered in such patients.

Non-tuberculous mycobacterial infections were associated with an absence of anti-38 kDa antibody despite a positive sputum smear. *M kansasii* and *M xenopi* are the two most commonly isolated non-tuberculous mycobacterial species in the London area\(^7\) and are usually resistant to pyrazinamide and isoniazid. While bacteriological confirmation is awaited, this group of patients could also receive ethambutol or streptomycin, or both—drugs recommended for the treatment of non-tuberculous mycobacterial infections\(^38-40\)—in addition to standard triple chemotherapy.

The measurement of titres of antibody to *M tuberculosis* specific antigens may be of value in the diagnosis of both smear positive and smear negative pulmonary tuberculosis. Antibody titres may also help to determine which patients should be treated in hospital, which require supervised chemotherapy, and which might require the addition of another drug to the standard regimen for the treatment of tuberculosis. This study has established which antigens or their epitopes might be of value in the management of patients with tuberculosis, together with cut off titres. Prospective evaluation of the role of serology, comparing patients whose antibody titres affected clinical management with patients where antibody levels were not known, together with a cost-benefit analysis, is essential before widespread use of these tests can be recommended.

We thank J van Embden (National Institute of Public Health and Hygiene, Bilthoven, The Netherlands) for the 65 kDa antigen, produced with support from the UNDP/World Bank/WHO-TDR special programme; Patrick Brennan (Fort Collins, University of Colorado, USA) for lipaрабиноманнанн; and M Pearson and M Rubens for the use of chest radiographic data.

### Table 4: Positive (+) and negative (−) associations between antibody specificity and clinical feature (associations with smear negative disease in bold type)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Antigen (epitope)</th>
<th>Clinical feature</th>
<th>14 kDa (TB68)</th>
<th>19 kDa (TB23)</th>
<th>38 kDa (TB71,TB72)</th>
<th>LAM (ML34)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Diagnosis</td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor prognosis</td>
<td>−</td>
<td></td>
<td>+</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>−</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recurrent disease</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>−</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radiographically extensive disease</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>−</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cavitation</td>
<td>NS</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>NS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-compliance</td>
<td>+†</td>
<td>NS</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>−†</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Isoniazid resistance</td>
<td>NS</td>
<td>NS</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>NS</td>
<td>−</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* A poor prognosis was associated with low titres of IgG antibody to the 14 kDa antigen but not of antibody to the TB68 epitope.
† Non-compliance was associated with a rise in the titre of antibody to the TB68 epitope.
‡ Isoniazid resistance was associated with a fall in the titre of antibody to the TB72 epitope.
LAM—lipaрабиноманнанн; NS—no significant association.
Clinical value of the measurement of Mycobacterium tuberculosis specific antibody in pulmonary tuberculosis


