Empirical treatment without bronchoscopy for 
*Pneumocystis carinii* pneumonia in the acquired immunodeficiency syndrome

R F MILLER, A B MILLAR, I V D WELLER, S J G SEMPLE

From the Department of Medicine, University College and Middlesex School of Medicine, Middlesex Hospital, London, and the Academic Department of Genitourinary Medicine, Middlesex Hospital, London

ABSTRACT An empirical approach to treating *Pneumocystis carinii* pneumonia was adopted in a prospective study of 73 men with antibodies to human immunodeficiency virus 1 (HIV-1) presenting with respiratory problems. At presentation 49 patients (group 1) were thought to have a history, findings at clinical examination, chest radiograph, and arterial blood gas tensions typical of pneumocystis pneumonia, and empirical treatment was begun immediately. Twenty four patients (group 2) were thought to have features not typical of pneumocystis pneumonia. All patients were subsequently referred for bronchoscopy to determine the diagnosis. In group 1 four patients were excluded from the analysis because bronchoscopy was not possible. Of the remaining 45, 42 had pneumocystis pneumonia, which was diagnosed at bronchoscopy in 40, and on the basis of the clinical response to co-trimoxazole in two who had negative results from investigations. Of the three patients without pneumocystis pneumonia, one patient with lymphoid interstitial pneumonitis and *Branhamella catarrhalis* infection would have failed to respond to empirical treatment. The other two had multiple bacterial pathogens at bronchoscopy; one already had Kaposi's sarcoma and the other would have been misdiagnosed as having AIDS. In group 2 a specific diagnosis was made at bronchoscopy in 21 cases, including pneumocystis pneumonia in seven (all had atypical chest radiographs). In three cases no diagnosis was made and spontaneous recovery occurred. Adopting an empirical approach to treatment for typical pneumocystis pneumonia (group 1) led to the correct treatment in 43 of 45 cases (95%) and would have saved 44 of the 45 of bronchoscopies in this group. Adopting an empirical approach would have caused one patient to be misdiagnosed as having AIDS. Overall, 44 out of 69 bronchoscopies (64%) would have been saved; the specificity for the diagnosis of pneumocystis pneumonia was 85% and the sensitivity was 85%. Adopting an “empirical” treatment policy for typical pneumocystis pneumonia will cause a large reduction in the number of “high risk” bronchoscopies performed.

Introduction

It has been advocated that all patients with suspected *Pneumocystis carinii* pneumonia who have antibodies to human immunodeficiency virus 1 (HIV-1) or who are from a “high risk” group should undergo fibre-optic bronchoscopy and bronchoalveolar lavage, with or without transbronchial biopsy, for a definitive diagnosis before treatment is begun.

Whether this policy is a realistic one is questionable. In logistic terms, bronchoscopy for every HIV-1 antibody positive patient presenting with respiratory symptoms and signs may soon be impossible. By December 1988 a total of 1982 cases of AIDS had been reported in the United Kingdom.

Published data would suggest that over 60% of all patients with AIDS will have a respiratory illness (and some will have repeated episodes) during progression of the disease. The large and increasing numbers of patients requiring investigation of respiratory problems will place very heavy demands on clinicians, nursing staff, and in particular the laboratory services. The use of induced sputum to make a diagnosis will certainly reduce the numbers needing bronchoscopy but will not completely eliminate the need for this procedure.

Address for reprint requests: Dr R F Miller, University College and Middlesex School of Medicine, Middlesex Hospital, London W1N 8AA.

Accepted 5 April 1989
We have previously reported our experience with 13 patients with a presumed diagnosis of pneumocystis pneumonia who were treated empirically without bronchoscopy. In that study we proposed: (a) that patients with a history, findings at physical examination, chest radiograph, and arterial blood gas tensions typical of pneumocystis pneumonia did not need bronchoscopy to confirm the diagnosis and could be treated empirically with "high dose" intravenous co-trimoxazole; only those who had failed to respond by day 5 of treatment or who deteriorated at any stage should undergo bronchoscopy; (b) that patients with clinical features, chest radiograph, and arterial blood gas tensions that were not typical of pneumocystis pneumonia should also undergo bronchoscopy at or soon after presentation. This management plan is summarised in figure 1. In the present study we have prospectively examined the effects of adopting this empirical approach to treatment in patients presenting with features suggesting pneumocystis pneumonia, checking the validity of the approach from the findings at subsequent bronchoscopy.

Methods

We studied 73 HIV-1 antibody positive patients presenting with respiratory symptoms prospectively. All were male homosexuals with ages ranging from 21 to 62 (mean 41) years. On presentation a clinical history was taken, the patient was examined, a chest radiograph was obtained, and an arterial blood gas sample was obtained with the patient breathing room air. On the basis of the history, results of examination, chest radiograph, and blood gas analysis the patients were immediately assigned to one of two groups, depending on whether the findings were regarded as typical of pneumocystis pneumonia (group 1) or not (group 2). The criteria used in the allocation of patients to the two groups are listed in table 1. An empirical approach to treatment was adopted in group 1, who were immediately treated with "high dose" intravenous co-trimoxazole. The patients in group 2 had one or more features of their history, findings at physical examination, chest radiograph, or blood gas tensions that were not usually seen in pneumocystis pneumonia and the presentation was considered atypical. These patients underwent bronchoscopy for a definite diagnosis.

Once treatment had been started in patients in group 1, we proceeded to perform bronchoscopies to obtain a laboratory based diagnosis for each patient, so that the validity of the "empirical" treatment policy could be tested. Bronchoscopy was carried out with the patient sitting semi-upright and the bronchoscope was passed via the nose. Intravenous atropine 0.6 mg and metoclopamide 10 mg were given at the start of the procedure and topical lignocaine was applied to the nose and pyriform fossae (10% solution), to the vocal cords (4%), and below the cords (2%). During the procedure intravenous midazolam (2.5-7.5 mg) with or without alfentanil (0.25-0.5 mg) was used for sedation. Bronchoalveolar lavage was performed with 180 ml of warmed buffered saline in 60 ml aliquots, and transbronchial biopsy specimens were obtained, without fluoroscopic control, from the

| Table 1 Criteria for a clinical diagnosis of Pneumocystis carinii pneumonia |
|---------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Group 1: Typical of pneumocystis pneumonia | Group 2: Not typical of pneumocystis pneumonia |
| Recent onset of dyspnoea (days/weeks) | Productive cough, purulent sputum, haemoptysis |
| Dry cough with or without mucoid sputum | Chest pain (with or without pleuritic pain) |
| Inability to take in a deep breath not due to pleuritic pain | Examination of chest: signs of consolidation or effusion |
| Examination of chest: fine end inspiratory crackles, especially basally, or normal | Chest radiograph: focal abnormalities such as lobar consolidation or pleural effusion(s) or mediastinal lymphadenopathy |
| Chest radiograph: bilateral alveolar or interstitial shadowing or normal | Blood gas tensions: hypoxaemia |

Fig 1 Management plan for patients with suspected Pneumocystis carinii pneumonia. BAL—bronchoalveolar lavage; TBB—transbronchial biopsy.
lower lobe (usually the lateral segment of the right lower lobe). Lavage fluid was examined cytologically and microbiologically, and the transbronchial biopsy specimens were examined histologically and microbiologically.

**Results**

**GROUP 1 (typical Pneumocystis carinii pneumonia)**

Of the 49 patients in this group, four were excluded from the analysis because bronchoscopy could not be carried out. One patient refused bronchoscopy but after treatment with intravenous co-trimoxazole was begun *P. carinii* was isolated from induced sputum. The other three patients were too ill to undergo bronchoscopy because of refractory hypoxaemia despite supplemental oxygen. All deteriorated rapidly despite intravenous co-trimoxazole and died in respiratory failure. Postmortem examinations were refused.

The bronchoscopic diagnosis in the remaining 45 patients is shown in figure 2. A diagnosis of pneumocystis pneumonia was confirmed in 40 patients, including one patient who also had a heavy growth of *Staphylococcus aureus*. This patient deteriorated with intravenous co-trimoxazole, developing respiratory failure, but recovered when given oxygen by continuous positive airways pressure and flucloxacillin.

**GROUP 2 (atypical features)**

There were 24 patients in this group. The bronchoscopic diagnoses in these patients is shown in figure 3.

![Diagram](https://example.com/diagram.png)

**Fig 3** Group 2: Pneumonia not typical of Pneumocystis carinii.

Other diagnoses: 2 lymphoid interstitial pneumonitis; 1 non-specific fibrosis; 2 chronic inflammation; 3 Kaposi’s sarcoma, endobronchial (one also had *S. aureus* and one also had *B. catarrhalis*); 6 other infections (1 Streptococcus pneumoniae and cytomegalovirus pneumonia; 1 β haemolytic streptococcus; 1 actinomycosis; 1 H influenzae, *S. aureus* and acid and alcohol fast bacilli; 1 acid and alcohol fast bacilli; 1 *B. catarrhalis, S. aureus*, β haemolytic streptococcus group G).

Six patients had *P. carinii* alone and another had *P. carinii* and *M. tuberculosis*. The radiological features that made the presentation of these patients atypical for pneumocystis pneumonia are listed in table 2. In 14 patients other diagnoses were made (fig 3). In three patients no specific diagnosis was made. One patient, who was having treatment for cerebral toxoplasmosis with sulphadiazine and pyrimethamine and who also had cutaneous Kaposi’s sarcoma, presented with a rapid onset of high fever and cough and right middle lobe consolidation on his chest radiograph (confirmed by computed tomography). At bronchoscopy no endobronchial lesion was seen, biopsy and lavage specimens from the middle lobe were negative, and the consolidation cleared rapidly without treatment. A second patient, with a four week history of fever and...
cough without dyspnoea and radiological evidence of a left subpulmonary effusion, also had negative biopsy and lavage specimens and spontaneous resolution of his symptoms and effusion. The third patient, with a three month history of cough and exertional dyspnoea, had a bulky left hilum on the chest radiograph but no endobronchial abnormality was detected at bronchoscopy and laboratory investigations gave negative results. His symptoms improved and a subsequent computed tomogram of the thorax was normal.

The mean (range) arterial oxygen tensions at presentation were 9·5 (5·2–12·2) kPa for group 1 and 10·8 (7·8–14) kPa for group 2. The standard error of the difference between means was 2·819 (p < 0·01).

Induced sputum was obtained from 10 of the 40 patients with bronchoscopically confirmed pneumocystis pneumonia. None of these specimens was positive for P carinii; nine showed a mixed growth of upper respiratory tract commensals, and one had no growth. Induced sputum was not obtained in the two patients with clinically suspected (but bronchoscopically negative) pneumocystis pneumonia or in two of the patients with other diagnoses. The induced sputum in the patient with a heavy mixed growth of S aureus, β haemolytic streptococci, and Branhamella catarrhalis contained a mixed growth of upper respiratory tract commensals.

Discussion

The first case of AIDS in the United Kingdom was described in 1981 and by December 1988 there had been 1982 cases and 1059 deaths.4 The lung is the organ most commonly affected in AIDS6 and over 60% of patients with AIDS will have a respiratory illness during the course of their disease,6 many experiencing repeated respiratory illnesses. Fibreoptic bronchoscopy is generally regarded as the procedure of choice for diagnosing pulmonary opportunistic infections in HIV-1 antibody positive patients with symptoms.6 It is recommended that both bronchoalveolar lavage and transbronchial biopsy are performed6 as the yield from these two procedures is complementary and extremely high.13 The potential impact of this policy in AIDS, with a projected doubling time of the number of cases in the United Kingdom of 11 months, is of great practical importance.

In the general population fibreoptic bronchoscopy is known to be a safe procedure with an extremely low risk of complications,10 but in patients who are HIV-1 antibody positive the complication rate associated with bronchoscopy is much higher.11,12 The complications are largely associated with transbronchial biopsy and occur whether or not fluoroscopic control is used.12 The risk of complications, particularly haemorrhage and pneumothorax, is particularly high when transbronchial biopsy is performed in patients whose lungs are infected with P carinii.12 At the time of this study we routinely carried out both lavage and transbronchial biopsy, but now no longer perform transbronchial biopsy because of the risk of complications and the low yield of additional diagnoses it produces.13

The use of induced sputum is a useful initial step in experienced laboratories in the evaluation of HIV-1 antibody positive patients with respiratory symptoms;14 it should eventually help to reduce the number of bronchoscopic investigations performed, but it will not completely remove the need. Its diagnostic accuracy is up to 79%.14 Bronchoscopy will still be necessary in those with negative results from induced sputum examination and in those whose clinical diagnosis and response to treatment are at variance with the microbiological or cytological diagnosis obtained from induced sputum. At the time of this study induced sputum examination was not routinely available in our hospital and bronchoscopy was the usual investigation.

Pneumocystis pneumonia is the mode of presentation in over half of all cases of AIDS,15 and it is responsible for up to 85% of all cases of pneumonia in AIDS.16 In this study the typical presenting features of pneumocystis pneumonia (group 1, table 1) included a dry cough, which might have been of short or long duration,17,18 and often a sensation of difficulty in taking in a deep breath.7 Pyrexia was almost invariable but patients rarely complained of fever.16 On examination the chest may be entirely normal or fine basal crackles may be heard. Signs of consolidation suggest bacterial infection and pleural effusion, tuberculosis,19 and these features would be atypical (group 2, table 1). The chest radiograph in P carinii infection is typically normal initially.20 Subsequently diffuse reticular shadowing, particularly in the perihilar region, is seen and this may progress to give a diffuse air space consolidation resembling pulmonary oedema.21 In the late stages the lungs may be massively consolidated and almost airless.22 Atypically, P carinii may also produce focal changes and cavitation on the chest radiograph, suggesting tuberculosis,23 or cystic or honeycomb lesions or hilar enlargement.22 Focal abnormalities or localised consolidation are changes more typical of bacterial pneumonia.24 Pleural effusions and mediastinal lymphadenopathy are rarely seen with pneumocystis pneumonia and suggest other diseases, in particular Kaposi's sarcoma, tuberculosis, and fungal infection.25

Arterial blood gas analysis may show normal oxygen tensions in patients with pneumocystis pneumonia but hypoxaemia is more usual. In one
Empirical treatment without bronchoscopy for Pneumocystis carinii pneumonia in AIDS

The policy adopted in this study has been criticised because (1) a definite pathogen could not be identified; (2) AIDS related pneumonia may be caused by a wide range of pathogens, frequently with a second pathogen; (3) a therapeutic response to high dose co-trimoxazole does not preclude the possibility of an infection with bacteria sensitive to co-trimoxazole; (4) identification of *P carinii* (or other opportunist organisms) establishes the diagnosis of AIDS, and permits discussion of the disease and prognosis with the patient, which is not possible if the diagnosis is “high dose co-trimoxazole responsive pneumonia.”

Since then it has become apparent that second pathogens are not seen as frequently as previously reported (PC Hopewell, personal communication) and in particular the role of cytomegalovirus as a pathogen in AIDS related pneumonia has been questioned. Multiple bacterial isolates are often encountered in both induced sputum and lavage fluid but their role as pathogens is doubtful. The technique of protected catheter acquisition of samples at fibre-optic bronchoscopy and their quantitative microbiological analysis gives reliable information where multiple organisms are seen in routine cultures of induced sputum or lavage fluid, but these techniques are not widely used.

An empirical approach raises important ethical issues: in particular, can an HIV-1 antibody positive patient be confidently told that he or she has pneumocystis pneumonia on clinical grounds without bronchoscopy? This and other issues, however, have not largely been resolved with the revision of the case definition criteria for AIDS, as a clinical diagnosis of pneumocystis pneumonia with response to anti-pneumocystis treatment in an HIV-1 antibody positive patient is sufficient to make a diagnosis of AIDS and places the patient in CDC category IV c. In addition, in recent months it has become apparent that a substantial proportion if not all of the HIV-1 antibody positive patients will ultimately develop AIDS.

In our patients who presented with features typical of pneumocystis pneumonia (group 1) two patients had negative results in investigations but responded rapidly to treatment and were thought to have pneumocystis pneumonia. One of the three remaining patients, who had lymphoid interstitial pneumonitis and *B catarrhalis*, would not have improved by day 5 of treatment and would have had bronchoscopy at that stage. An empirical approach would have been detrimental in the two other cases as they would have received inappropriately high doses of antibiotics with the associated risks of toxicity, and as they responded to high dose intravenous co-trimoxazole would have been misdiagnosed as having AIDS. One of these two patients already had Kaposi’s sarcoma, so the error would not have altered the diagnosis of AIDS; the other developed Kaposi’s sarcoma within six months of this respiratory episode. Bronchoscopy was justified in all the patients with atypical presentations (group 2). Adopting an empirical approach would have been the correct decision in 43 of the 45 patients (95%) in group 1 and would have obviated bronchoscopy in 44 of the 69 patients (64%). This empirical approach to treating pneumocystis pneumonia has a specificity of 85% and a sensitivity of 85%.

This is the first study to confirm the validity of an empirical treatment policy for pneumocystis pneumonia. Empirical treatment of patients presenting with clinical and radiological features typical of pneumocystis pneumonia led to the correct management in over 95% of cases. Adopting this policy would potentially be associated with a greater than 63% reduction in the number of bronchoscopies carried out on HIV positive patients with respiratory symptoms. The implications in terms of work load for chest physicians and those caring for HIV positive patients are obvious. An empirical treatment policy carries a small risk of overdiagnosis of AIDS, but it remains to be seen whether this is of major importance in the light of current knowledge of the disease progression of HIV infection.

IVDW is a Wellcome Trust senior lecturer in infectious diseases. We would like to thank Dr Brian Newman, department of statistics, University College London, for statistical advice and Miss Annette Skinner for typing the manuscript.

References


5 Murray JF, Felton CP, Garay SM, *et al.* Pulmonary complications of the acquired immunodeficiency


