Ethnic differences in selective neonatal BCG immunisation: White British children miss out

Ramesh Srinivasan¹, Leena Menon¹, Pat Stevens ², Ian Campbell ³, Mazin Alfaham¹.
¹ Department of Child Health, Llandough Hospital, Cardiff, UK.
² TB Control Service, Llandough Hospital, Cardiff, UK.
³ Department of Respiratory Medicine, Llandough Hospital, Cardiff, UK.

CORRESPONDING AUTHOR:
Dr. Ramesh Srinivasan, M.D
Specialist Registrar,
Dept. of Child Health, Llandough Hospital,
Penlan Road, Penarth, Cardiff, U.K.
CF64 2XX
Tel: +44 (0)2920 716863
Fax: +44(0) 2920716048
Email: ramsriniv@doctors.org.uk

KEY WORDS: Tuberculosis, Infant, BCG vaccine, Ethnicity.
ABSTRACT:

Background: Tuberculosis (TB) is a re-emerging problem especially in the larger cities of Western Europe. Selective neonatal BCG (Bacille Calmette –Guerin) vaccination is recommended for infants at risk of TB in the United Kingdom. Neonatal BCG is safe and effective, with an overall protective value of 75%. This study aimed to assess BCG rates among at risk infants in Cardiff and the Vale of Glamorgan, South Wales in the year 2003.

Methods: A cohort of infants at risk for TB was identified from demographic data stored on a computerised maternity activity database. A manual search of immunisation records determined overall rates and the rates for infants belonging to various ethnic groups.

Results: Among 5308 infants born in 2003, 514 (9.6%) were at risk of TB. 423 (82.2%) of these infants were referred postnatally for BCG, of whom 391 received it. 26 of the 41 ‘at risk’ White British infants missed BCG, compared to 47 of the 288 Asian and 7 of the 39 Black African babies who also missed the vaccination. The BCG rate among White British infants was 36.5 %, compared 83.6% for Asian infants from the Indian subcontinent. ($\chi^2 = 7.25, \ p < 0.01$) and the 82 % for Black African infants. ($\chi^2 = 4.48, \ p < 0.05$).

Conclusions: The overall BCG rate among at risk infants in Cardiff was 76 % during the study period. Vaccination rate was poor among White British infants compared to those from other ethnic groups. Enhanced awareness of health professionals in recognising the need for vaccinating certain White children at risk of TB is essential to improve BCG coverage in an increasingly multiethnic population.
INTRODUCTION:
Since the beginning of the nineteenth century notification rates for TB have been on the
decline owing to improvements in living conditions, nutrition, introduction of anti-
tuberculosis chemotherapy and BCG immunisation. However, Tuberculosis is now re –
emerging especially in the larger cities of Western Europe. [1] Increasing levels of
deprivation in the inner city areas and immigration of families from countries with high
prevalence of TB are probably the important factors involved with this trend. [2]
In the United Kingdom (UK) notifications of TB declined tenfold between 1948 and 1987.
However, the steady increase since then is a matter of concern. [3] In a survey conducted
by the Public Health Laboratory Service in England and Wales the annual rate for newly
notified cases were 10.93 per 100,000 populations in 1998. This represents an increase of
11 % from the survey in 1993 and 21 % from 1988.[4] Childhood TB notification rates in
England and Wales decreased at an average rate of 7.2% each year from 1978 to 1988, but
there has been a steady increase in notification rates ever since. [5] Surveillance of
childhood TB from September 1996 to December 1999 conducted through the Welsh
Paediatric Surveillance System reported 38 cases of TB and 59 children on
chemoprophylaxis. The majority of cases were noted to be in the White population and
most had not received BCG. [6] This was consistent with a previous study conducted in
Wales. [7] Although South Wales is a low prevalence area, tuberculosis in childhood is
increasing and preventive measures are clearly important. We therefore undertook this
study to assess the coverage of a selective neonatal BCG immunisation programme aimed
at vaccinating infants at risk for TB.

METHODS:
We conducted a review of the selective neonatal BCG immunisation programme within the
Cardiff and Vale NHS trust which serves the population of Cardiff City and the Vale of
Glamorgan, South Wales. Local guidelines exist for the identification of infants at risk for
TB who should be referred for BCG vaccination. This is shown in table 1. [3, 8-11]

- Parents originating from India, Pakistan, Bangladesh, Asia, Africa, Eastern Europe,
  Central & South America, Caribbean and Middle east even if UK born.
- Parents who are asylum seekers / refugees from any country.
- Parent/ close living relative with active TB or a past history of TB.
- Parent/ close living relative who is a close contact of pulmonary TB and has been asked
to attend for screening.
- Those from travelling families
- History of parental drug abuse.

Table 1: Selective neonatal BCG immunisation: Criteria for referral (TB control service, Cardiff and Vale
NHS trust).

There is a single tick box for TB risk in the antenatal clerking sheet. The information
needed to categorise risk is assessed at the pregnancy booking interview. All midwifery
staff are provided with the above criteria for identifying need for selective neonatal BCG
vaccination. However sensitive information relating to drug abuse and travelling status may
be difficult to elicit and details are not explicit in these forms apart from the need to
vaccinate these infants. (in some cases this information may be available only postnatally)
This data is held on a computerised maternity database maintained by the Cardiff birth
survey. However, referral to the BCG clinic takes place postnatally by midwifery staff
following birth of the infant. If missed at discharge, infants can also be referred by the
health visitor, general practitioner or other health care professionals to be vaccinated by the
team of two TB clinical nurse specialists who run the BCG vaccination service. A manual
documentation of referrals received, along with the original or faxed referral forms, are kept
on file. The aim is to vaccinate infants within six weeks of birth. Details of vaccination are recorded on BCG vaccination cards. Infants not immunised by 3 months of age are tuberculin tested. If found to be tuberculin negative, they are vaccinated. Infants found to be tuberculin positive are referred to local paediatric services for investigations and appropriate management. The vaccination process is summarised in figure 1.

Demographic data on pregnancies delivered between 1 January and 31 December 2003 were available from the maternity database. A list of infants at risk for TB was generated. Details of post-natal referral and vaccination outcome were retrieved from the manual records kept by the TB team. The efficacy of the vaccination process was determined by calculating the percentage of infants at risk who received BCG. In addition, vaccination rates among infants belonging to various ethnic groups were computed and differences analysed using the chi-square test.

RESULTS:
Of the 5308 live births recorded in the year 2003, a total of 514 infants (9.6%) were identified to be at risk for TB from computerised records based on antenatal information. Referrals for vaccination (done postnatally) were received for only 423 infants (82.2%). By 1 March 2004, 391 infants had received vaccination i.e. 76.0% of at risk infants or 92.4% of those referred. Nineteen infants (3.6%) had failed to attend repeated appointments. Five infants (0.9%) could not be traced. Eight infants (1.5%) were awaiting vaccination in the subsequent weeks. The pattern of BCG vaccination is depicted in figure 2.

The largest group (56%) of infants at risk were born to Asian parents originating from the Indian subcontinent (Indian, Pakistani & Bangladeshi) and 83.6% of these infants received BCG. The vaccination rate among infants born to Black African parents was much the same (82%). Out of 41 White British infants only 15 received BCG (36.5%). 25 of these 41 infants (61%) were not referred and one infant was not brought to BCG clinic despite repeated appointments. The vaccination rate was 71% among the 146 infants from the remaining ethnic groups which included Chinese (n=16), other Black (n=7), other White (n=6), other Asian (n=31), mixed (n=52), unclassified (n=28) and not stated (n=6) as shown in table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnic group</th>
<th>‘at risk’ (frequency)</th>
<th>Vaccinated (frequency)</th>
<th>Uptake (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Asian-Pakistani</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>84.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian - Indian</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>82.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian -Bangladeshi</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>85.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black African</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>82.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White British</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>36.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other ethnic groups</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>70.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>514</td>
<td>391</td>
<td>76.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: Vaccination uptake status according to ethnicity

There were significant differences in the vaccination rates between
White British Infants compared to Asian and Black African infants.
Asian 83.6 % vs. White British 36.5 %; $\chi^2 = 7.25$, $p < 0.01$; Black African 82 % vs.
White British 35.6 %; $\chi^2 = 4.48$ $p < 0.05$.

DISCUSSION:
BCG vaccination is an effective preventive measure against TB, although estimates of its
efficacy vary enormously between different studies. In a meta analysis of four randomised
control trials addressing the efficacy of neonatal BCG, an overall protective rate of 74 %
was demonstrated. It was higher (78%) for miliary TB but slightly lower (64%) against TB
meningitis [12]. BCG vaccination recommendations for infants vary among the various
countries of Western Europe and even among cities of the same country in a few instances.
In France, Finland and Portugal BCG vaccination in infancy is universal, while only high
risk groups are targeted in Belgium, Greece and the UK. Infants belonging to high risk
groups receive the vaccine in Milan (Italy) and Corke (Ireland) while those born in Rome
and Dublin do not [1].
The Department of Health for England, the Welsh and Scottish office [3] and the British
Thoracic Society [13] currently advise targeting infants belonging to high risk groups for
vaccination. Our data demonstrated an overall BCG rate of 76 %. Ahmed and Hicks from
Bristol showed a rate of 13.3 % (14), whilst Gill and Scott reported 6 % in Bolton. [15].
Both these studies demonstrated improvements to over 80 % after intensive training of
midwifery and health visiting personnel. Wyllie and Eastham from Middlesborough found
a 42% rate [16], whilst Deshpande demonstrated a 51 % BCG rate by at risk infants in
Shropshire [17]. It is important to note that none of the previous studies emphasised the low
BCG uptake among White British infants at risk. The differences in the percentage rates
between the different ethnic groups in our study is concerning, a third of White British
infants compared with over 80 % for Asian and Black African infants. White British infants
at risk of TB would be predominantly referred under three categories- Family history of
TB, parental drug abuse or belonging to travelling families. The low uptake among White
British infants may be attributed to the failure of health care professionals to appreciate that
among this ethnic grouping there are certain infants at increased risk of TB. Presuming ‘no
risk’ for TB just because an infant is of White ethnicity is seemingly, the reason for this
occurrence.
Lack of computerised post natal records linking up to antenatal data and lack of
communication among health care professionals are possible shortcomings. Practical
difficulties are also inherent in the implementation of such a selective immunisation
programmes in that the definition of what is considered at high risk is not always
straightforward and some children in need of immunisation may be missed primarily due to
lack of this awareness. Lack of written communication from those assessing risk initially,
shortages of BCG supply, travelling families, changes of infant surnames add to the
difficulty of ensuring adequate BCG uptake.
The results of this study have been presented to the midwifery teams and at Paediatric and
Obstetric departmental meetings. Documentation of ethnicity on BCG vaccination cards
and record of the indication for referral have been implemented. Increased awareness of
perinatal staff regarding the high risk categories for TB and heightened perception of the
vulnerability of a certain group of White infants are the keys to improving coverage. The
results of this study have a wider applicability recognising that we live in an increasingly
multiethnic European society which brings forth certain common health care provision
issues.
REFERENCES:


ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS: We gratefully acknowledge the help of Mrs Gwyneth Ratcliffe of Cardiff birth survey for access to computerised antenatal records and demographic information.
CONFLICT OF INTEREST AND SOURCES OF FUNDING: None.
Midwife booking the pregnancy identifies infants at risk of TB.

↓

Indicates the need for BCG vaccination after birth.

↓

Postnatally, midwife completes referral card at infant discharge after birth

↓

Referral faxed / sent to TB clinic via internal mail.

↓

TB clinic schedule an appointment < 6 weeks of age

↓

Infant receives BCG vaccination.

*Figure 1: Process of BCG vaccination*
Figure 2: Uptake of Neonatal BCG vaccination in Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan (2003)
Ethnic differences in selective neonatal BCG immunisation: white British children miss out

Ramesh Srinivasan, Leena Menon, Pat Stevens, Ian Campbell and Mazin Alfaham

Thorax published online December 29, 2005

Updated information and services can be found at:
http://thorax.bmj.com/content/early/2005/12/29/thx.2004.036269.citation

These include:

Supplementary Material
Supplementary material can be found at:
http://thorax.bmj.com/content/suppl/2006/03/07/thx.2004.036269.DC1

Email alerting service
Receive free email alerts when new articles cite this article. Sign up in the box at the top right corner of the online article.

Topic Collections
Articles on similar topics can be found in the following collections
Drugs: infectious diseases (968)
Vaccination / immunisation (158)
Child health (843)

Notes

To request permissions go to:
http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions

To order reprints go to:
http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform

To subscribe to BMJ go to:
http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/