Evaluation of a directly observed six month fully intermittent treatment regimen for tuberculosis in patients suspected of poor compliance


Abstract

Background – Although a priority for tuberculosis control is to achieve the maximum cure rate, compliance with chemotherapy in specific high risk groups (homeless, intravenous drug abusers, chronic alcoholics) is usually poor.

Methods – From January 1990 to December 1994 102 patients with tuberculosis (96 pulmonary, six extrapulmonary) who were poorly compliant with treatment were treated with a six month fully intermittent (twice weekly) directly observed regimen. They comprised 71 homeless subjects, 50 chronic alcoholics, 23 intravenous drug abusers, nine infected with HIV, and 11 who had previously abandoned a daily antituberculosis regimen; 53 had more than one of these risk factors. Treatment included isoniazid and rifampicin for six months and pyrazinamide during the first two months. Patients who failed to take their medication on two consecutive occasions were actively sought by telephone or by personal search.

Results – After two months of treatment 95 of the 102 patients had taken their medication regularly and 90 of them had negative cultures. Four of the remaining patients had negative cultures after three months. At the end of the six months 87 patients had completed treatment and were considered cured. Only 15 patients abandoned the treatment (13 of whom had more than one risk factor). Only three relapses occurred in the 102 patients at one year follow up and in the 88 patients followed for two years. Two patients required a change of treatment due to major side effects. Although intravenous drug abuse was the only predictor of non-compliance in the multivariate analysis, if the available variables in the second month of treatment were analysed, current poor compliance and abandonment of treatment in the past were found to be significantly associated with non-compliance.

Conclusions – This study shows the efficacy of this intermittent regimen and the effectiveness of a directly observed treatment programme.

(Thorax 1996;51:1130–1133)

Keywords: tuberculosis, directly observed intermittent therapy, compliance.

The aim of all antituberculosis programmes is to increase the cure rate of patients receiving treatment. Although achievement of this goal is hindered by unfavourable socioeconomic and organisational conditions in developing countries, the implementation of appropriate controlled programmes based on short term chemotherapy has proved successful in obtaining a high cure rate amongst smear-positive patients. In industrialised countries the high incidence of elective termination of treatment registered amongst drug abusers, the homeless, and alcoholics has become a matter of concern.

In order to increase the cure rate it may be necessary to supervise the administration of all medications strictly and, in developing countries, to find low cost and effective regimens. Twice weekly treatment for 4–8 days is needed to reinitiate bacillary multiplication after exposing mycobacteria to bactericidal drugs – this regimen not only facilitates cost reduction and supervision of treatment but has been found to be as effective as daily antituberculosis regimens.

We assessed the effectiveness of a six month fully intermittent (twice weekly) treatment regimen in specific high risk groups likely to be non-compliant such as the homeless, chronic alcoholics, intravenous drug abusers, and patients who had previously abandoned daily antituberculosis treatment.

Methods

All patients with tuberculosis at risk of non-compliance who attended our hospital between January 1990 and December 1994 were eligible for inclusion in the study. The criteria for inclusion were a definitive diagnosis of tuberculosis based on laboratory identification of Mycobacterium tuberculosis, being homeless with no fixed abode and/or intravenous drug addict and/or a chronic alcoholic. Patients who had previously abandoned a daily antituberculosis regimen were also included provided that drug susceptibility testing excluded the presence of resistance to the drugs administered.

Intermittent antituberculosis treatment consisted of a six month regimen in which isoniazid (15 mg/kg per dose) and rifampicin (10 mg/kg per dose up to 600 mg) were given twice a week (Monday and Thursday) for six months and pyrazinamide (60 mg/kg per dose) during the first two months. According to our rate of initial resistance and/or systematic sensitivity
testing nor the use of a fourth drug in the first phase of treatment 12 appeared to be justified. During the first two months of treatment and while waiting for the results of drug sensitivity testing ethambutol (50 mg/kg per dose) was given to patients who had previously abandoned daily antituberculosis treatment. Drug sensitivity testing was only carried out in those with a positive culture in the second month of treatment. 13

Patients were requested to attend the hospital regularly for supervision of medication. At each visit they were informed about the seriousness of mycobacterial infection and the importance of compliance with the treatment regimen was stressed. They were also given a meal. A nurse supervised the procedure. Patients who failed to take their medication on two consecutive occasions were actively sought by telephone or by personal search. Most of the missing homeless were found in shelters.

A physical examination was carried out two weeks after starting treatment, at one, two, four and six months of treatment, and at six, 12, 18, and 24 months after completion of treatment. Bacteriological and biochemical investigations were performed at all visits and radiological studies were carried out at the beginning and at the end of treatment.

To assess the pharmacological effectiveness of intermittent antituberculosis treatment the following variables were analysed: percentage of patients with negative cultures at two months of treatment; number of patients with positive cultures at three months of treatment (pharmacological failures); percentage of patients in whom medication was discontinued or changed due to side effects; number of relapses at 24 months after completion of treatment; and number of patients cured (culture negative). Depending on the number of doses taken at the second, fourth, and sixth month, patients were divided into those who had taken all the required doses, those who had taken 75–99% of the required doses, those who had taken 50–75% of doses, and those who had taken less than 50%. Before finishing the programme patients were also classified into those who were compliant and those who had abandoned treatment.

**DATA ANALYSIS**

Statistical analyses were carried out by using the $\chi^2$ test (with Yates’ continuity correction when needed) and the odds ratio (OR) with 95% confidence intervals (CI). A logistic regression model was used to analyse predictive variables of non-compliance at the time of diagnosis and at the end of the second month of treatment. A $p$ value of $<0.01$ was considered to be statistically significant. All calculations were performed with the SPSS-PC and EGRET statistical packages.

**Results**

During the study period (January 1990 to December 1994) 104 patients with culture positive tuberculosis were included in the study, although two patients were excluded later because of side effects leaving a study population of 102 patients for analysis. Their age ranged from 18 to 87 years (mean 41.3 years) and 84 were men. Homelessness was registered in 71 patients, chronic alcoholism in 50, intravenous drug abuse in 23, and abandonment of previous treatment in 11. At least two of these conditions were present in 53 patients. Nine patients were seropositive for the human immunodeficiency virus (HIV), all of whom used heroin by the intravenous route. Pulmonary tuberculosis was diagnosed in 96 patients and extrapulmonary tuberculosis in six. Smear positive *M. tuberculosis* was found in 94 patients and eight were smear negative.

Table 1 shows the rate of compliance of the patients throughout the six month treatment period. At the end of the second month 95 patients attended the sessions regularly and 90 had negative cultures. Of the five patients with positive cultures one was lost to follow up shortly afterwards and four had negative cultures at three months. None of these five patients exhibited resistance to the drugs administered. At the end of the fourth and sixth months 88 and 87 patients, respectively, continued taking medications and all of them had negative *M. tuberculosis* cultures. At the end of six months only 15 patients had abandoned treatment, 13 of whom had more than one risk factor at the time of inclusion in the study. Two patients who discontinued treatment (both during the first month) sought medical care 13 and 18 months later because of active pulmonary tuberculosis; none of the other patients appear to have been treated at the other hospitals in Gran Canaria.

The results of univariate analysis are shown in table 2. Abandonment of treatment occurred more frequently in women, in those aged under 55 years, and in those with extrapulmonary tuberculosis, smear positive tuberculosis, HIV seropositivity, homelessness, chronic alcoholism, intravenous drug abuse, abandonment of treatment in the past, and poor adherence to treatment at the second month. The five women who dropped out were intravenous drug abusers and indigents (table 2). Low compliance at two months was the only variable significantly associated with abandonment of treatment ($p<0.0001$).

At the time of diagnosis intravenous drug abuse was the only statistically significant variable in the multivariate analysis (OR 4.62; 95% CI 1.21 to 17.54; $p = 0.02$) although homelessness, chronic alcoholism, and abandonment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1 Compliance with intermittent antituberculosis treatment ($n=102$)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of doses taken under nurse supervision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd month</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75–99%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50–74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&lt;50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abandonments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture negative</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Sputum conversion.
of previous treatment almost reached statistical significance ($p \geq 0.1$). At the end of the second month of treatment abandonment of past treatment was significantly associated with non-compliance (OR 8.87; 95% CI 1.15 to 68.15; $p<0.05$).

Only three relapses occurred in the 102 patients followed up for one year and in the 88 patients followed for two years. The relapse rate at two years was 3.4%. The three relapses at one year occurred in an indigent patient, a patient who was an intravenous drug abuser and a chronic alcoholic, and another who had been non-compliant with treatment in the past.

Two patients were excluded from the analysis because of side effects which required a change of treatment (a case of “flu-like” syndrome attributed to the intermittent use of rifampicin and one of hepatitis associated with isoniazid).

Eleven patients experienced transient side effects including gastric symptoms (seven), itching (three), and arthralgia with hyperuricaemia (one).

### Discussion

At present the ideal antituberculosis regimen consists of daily administration of isoniazid and rifampicin for six months, reinforced with pyrazinamide during the first two months. In areas with high rates of primary resistance ethambutol is added in the initial phase.\(^2\)\(^4\)\(^6\)

Regimens based on partial or fully intermittent administration of drugs are well established and have also been recommended. These include an initial two month period of daily administration, the use of four drugs in the initial phase, and the administration of drugs three times per week.\(^9\)\(^10\)\(^12\)\(^13\)\(^14\)\(^15\)\(^16\)\(^18\)\(^19\)\(^20\) However, a few studies of fully intermittent twice weekly regimens have been carried out with discouraging results.\(^7\)\(^17\)\(^18\) In the study by Paramasivam et al\(^18\) only 80% of patients were culture negative at the end of treatment, 49% did not complete the short course chemotherapy regimen, and no data on relapses were given. We have obtained much better results using the same intermittent antituberculosis regimen which indicates the importance of directly observing drug taking in the success of this therapeutic strategy. Our findings are similar to those obtained in New York city,\(^19\)\(^20\) adopting similar measures although with far fewer resources. Supervision of drug taking from the beginning of treatment has been extensively recommended when factors such as poverty, homelessness, intravenous drug abuse, or anticipation of non-compliance are present, otherwise a very low cure rate will be achieved.\(^7\)\(^9\)

In tuberculosis control programmes for high risk groups developed in Gran Canaria in 1988 and 1989\(^22\) 87% and 83%, respectively, of the patients abandoned antituberculosis treatment. These findings, and the results of the present study in which low compliance at two months was the only variable significantly associated with abandonment of treatment, further confirm the importance of directly observed administration of drugs. It is therefore necessary to develop special compliance-related strategies for high risk populations (such as those described in this study) including supervision of drug taking in patients on methadone maintenance programmes.\(^31\)

According to the recommendations of the American Thoracic Society,\(^34\) for a short term chemotherapy strategy to be considered acceptable both therapeutic failures and relapses should not exceed 5% and adverse effects of treatment should not cause a change in the therapeutic regimen in more than 5% of patients. The present results fulfil these specifications (no failures, relapse rate of 3.4% in 88 patients followed for over two years after completion of treatment, 1.9% adverse effects) and the rate of negative cultures at the end of the second month (94.7%) confirms the effectiveness of six months of fully intermittent (twice weekly) tuberculosis treatment. These figures are similar to those obtained in islanders treated with a standard course of medication.\(^32\)

The main problems with the treatment of tuberculosis are supervision of the patients until they are cured and the cost of achieving this in developing countries. Both problems could be solved with the supervised treatment under study as it would be necessary to observe 52 drug administrations directly to control the entire treatment, fewer than the 60 that would be needed for daily supervision during the first two months of the recommended regimens by the International Union against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease and the World Health Organisation.\(^15\)\(^13\)\(^14\)\(^15\)\(^36\) On the other hand, doses of rifampicin (the most expensive drug) in the intermittent regimen are equal to those used in daily regimens. This, together with the fact that treatment is provided on an outpatient basis, results in a substantial reduction in the cost of treatment.

In summary, this study shows the effectiveness of a fully intermittent antituberculosis regimen from the beginning of treatment, and the efficiency of an incentive programme in
Compliance with intermittent treatment for tuberculosis

which administration of the medication was
directly supervised by the nursing staff. This
regimen may constitute a valuable strategy in
tuberculosis control programmes in developing
countries and for treating high risk patients in
whom non-compliance is anticipated, espe-
cially in industrialised countries.

This study was supported by a grant from Sociedad Española
de Patología Respiratoria (SEPAR). We thank Elena Torres,
Candelaria Bobaina and Marta Escobar who were responsible for
supervising drug taking and Dr Marra Pulido for editing the
manuscript and editorial assistance.

1 Enarson DA. Principles of IUATLD collaborative tubercu-
2 World Health Organization. WHO Expert Committee on tuber-
1974.
3 Caminero JA. Medidas básicas para el control de la tuber-
culosi en una comunidad. Med Clin (Barc) 1994;102:
67-73.
4 Chum HJ. The Tanzania National Tuberculosis/Lepra
Programme in the face of HIV infection. Bull Int Union
5 Arguelles L. Results of the tuberculosis control programme
6 Medical Research Council Tuberculosis and Chest Diseases Unit. Treatment of pulmonary tuberculosis in patients
notified in England and Wales in 1978-9: chemotherapy
7 Brudney K, Dobkin J. Resurgent tuberculosis in New
York City. Human immunodeficiency virus, homelessness, and
the decline of tuberculosis control programs. Am Rev Respi-
8 Prevention and control of tuberculosis among homeless
persons. Recommendations of the Advisory Council for
the Elimination of Tuberculosis. MMWR 1992;41(RR 5):
13-23.
9 Ferrer X, Kirchhauaen, Toro J, Jadue J, Munoz M,
Espinosa A. Compliance with tuberculosis treatment in adults
in Santiago, Chile. Bol Soc Med Panam 1991;111:
423-3.
10 Joint Tuberculosis Committee of the British Thoracic So-
ciety. Control and prevention of tuberculosis in the United
200.
bactericidal activity of drugs in patients with pulmonary
12 Mutchison DA. Basic mechanisms of chemotherapy. Chest
1975;76(Suppl):771-81.
13 Subcommittee of the Joint Tuberculosis Committee. Chemotherapy and management of tuberculosis in the
United Kingdom: recommendations of the Joint Tuber-
culosi Committee of the British Thoracic Society. Thorax
1990;45:403-8.
14 American Thoracic Society. Treatment of tuberculosis and
tuberculosis infection in adults and children. Am J Respir
15 International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Dis-
eases. Committee of Treatment. Bull Int Union Tuberc
Lung Dis 1998;63:64.
16 World Health Organization. Treatment of tuberculosis. Guide-
lines for national programmes. Geneva: World Health Or-
ganization, 1993.
Evaluation of a directly observed six months fully intermittent treatment regimen for tuberculosis in patients suspected of poor compliance.

J A Caminero, J M Pavón, F Rodríguez de Castro, F Díaz, G Julià, J A Caylà and P Cabrera

Thorax 1996 51: 1130-1133
doi: 10.1136/thx.51.11.1130

Updated information and services can be found at:
http://thorax.bmj.com/content/51/11/1130

Email alerting service

These include:
Receive free email alerts when new articles cite this article. Sign up in the box at the top right corner of the online article.

Notes

To request permissions go to:
http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions

To order reprints go to:
http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform

To subscribe to BMJ go to:
http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/