Pleural calcification, pleural mesotheliomas, and bronchial cancers caused by tremolite dust

S YAYICI OGLU, R ILÇAYTO, K BALKI, B S şAYLI, AND B YORULMAZ

From the Departments of Chest Diseases and Pathology, Diyarbakir University Medical Faculty, and the Department of Genetics, Diyarbakir and Ankara Medical Faculties, Turkey

ABSTRACT Around the town of Çermik in south-east Turkey there are many deposits of asbestiform minerals, some of which are used to make whitewash or stucco. A sample of 7000 of the population revealed 461 (6.5%) with pleural thickening and calcification, of whom 103 (1.47% of the total) had evidence of interstitial pulmonary fibrosis. Forty-one patients with respiratory cancer were admitted to the Diyarbakir Chest Hospital from around Çermik and from a comparable area of equal population (but without asbestos deposits) in 1977–8. Of these 23 were mesotheliomas, 22 coming from around Çermik. In addition, 11 of the 18 primary bronchial cancers came from around Çermik. A similar excess of mesothelioma and bronchial cancer had been admitted from the Çermik area in previous years. The whitewash or stucco material has been shown to contain fibrous tremolite and non-fibrous antigorite/lizardite, chlorite, and talc. A lung biopsy of a patient from Çermik contained large numbers of tremolite fibres, both free and forming asbestos bodies. There were only occasional chrysotile fibres.

Çermik is a town in south-east Turkey. Since 1973 we have been reporting on investigations into the cause of "Çermik disease."1–5 In the present report we add new mineralogical and epidemiological information and discuss the significance of the pleuropulmonary disease in the district.

Around the town of Çermik are numerous outcrops of asbestiform minerals which are used to make whitewash and stucco for the walls and roofs of the houses. The first pulmonary abnormality to be noted was a high prevalence of pleural thickening with calcification. Subsequently it was noted that, compared with other...
districts in the area served by the Diyarbakir Chest Hospital, there was a very high incidence of pleural mesothelioma and a relatively high incidence of primary lung cancer. There were also cases of benign fibrosing pleurisy. The clinical picture was similar to that reported from further west in Turkey (Karain). The investigations were undertaken to determine the cause of this local excess of pleural and pulmonary disease in part of Turkey.

Methods

Figure 1 shows a map of this part of Turkey. The districts where outcrops of asbestiform minerals occur are shaded. Those with vertical shading were not investigated in detail. The outcrops are both most frequent and most frequently exploited in the three districts around Ergani, Çermik, and Cüngüş which are shaded obliquely and horizontally. The population of these three districts is 100,800.

Three thousand, seven hundred men and 3300 women over the age of 20 years were selected from these three districts and investigated with chest radiography. These individuals were those who could be persuaded to attend from villages in which fibrous minerals were known to be used, and do not represent a random sample (table 1). The films were all read by three chest physicians working independently.

Diyarbakir Chest Hospital serves these three districts as well as the others shown on the map. The population of the five asbestos districts listed in table 2, 227,000, is approximately equal to that of the seven non-asbestos districts, 217,000. During the period of the survey (1977 and 1978) there were 86 admissions to the Chest Hospital for neoplasms of the lung and pleura. These were analysed and only those 41 patients coming from the five asbestos districts and seven non-asbestos districts were considered. The diagnoses were established by the usual techniques and the frequency with which each diagnostic procedure was used is listed in table 3.

Results

POPULATION SURVEY

There were 451 cases of pleural calcification and thickening among the 7000 individuals selected (6.5%, table 1). There was no significant difference between the sexes but there was an increase in frequency with age. Few cases were seen in the 21–30 year age group but 69% were affected before the age of 70. The probability of developing pleural changes appeared to be normally distributed about an average of 50% at 65 years in this population.
Pulmonary changes appeared about 10 years later than the pleural changes and affected about 50% of the population over the age of 70 (table 1). The pleural change was sometimes very extensive. Figure 2 shows advanced pleural calcification in a man of only 36 years also from Çermik.

Only six cases of pulmonary tuberculosis were detected in the population survey, rather fewer than was expected for the general population of this region.

**ADMISSIONS TO HOSPITAL**

Of the 86 patients with primary tumours of the lungs and pleura admitted to Diyarbakir hospital in 1977–8, 33 came from the asbestos exposed districts and only eight from the control districts (table 2).

There were 23 patients with malignant pleural mesotheliomas, of whom only one came from the non-asbestos districts. The incidence appeared highest in the three districts where the radiological survey had been carried out (Çermik, Ergani, and Çüngüş). In these villages there were 17 cases during the period from a population of 100,000. The rate in Maden and Silerek was less than a third of this. Figure 3 shows a hylauronic acid. Bilateral pleural calcification is also present. Men and women were affected in equal numbers although the three patients under 40 years of age were all women (table 4). All the men and none of the women smoked cigarettes.

Primary bronchial cancer occurred in both asbestos and non-asbestos districts (table 2), 11 cases from the former, and seven from the latter. The difference is not statistically significant but when the figures are combined with those for the

**Table 4 Age and sex distribution of 41 patients with pleural and pulmonary malignant tumours**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age groups (yr)</th>
<th>Pleural tumour</th>
<th>Pulmonary tumour</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21–30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31–40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41–50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51–60</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61–70</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71+</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 5 Pleural and pulmonary cancers from asbestos and non-asbestos districts in this and previous studies**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years covered</th>
<th>Asbestos centres</th>
<th>Non-asbestos centres</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pleural tumours</td>
<td>Pulmonary tumours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1968–76</td>
<td>24 (10-55)</td>
<td>32 (14-07)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1977–8</td>
<td>22 (9-67)</td>
<td>11 (4-83)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Fig 2 Chest radiograph of a man aged 36 years from Çermik with shell-like calcification of the parietal and diaphragmatic pleurae. There is also thickening of the pleura at both apices.**

**Fig 3 Chest radiograph of a man aged 65 years from Ergani showing a right hydropneumothorax. Tumour (mesothelioma) is seen on the parietal wall on the right side. The fluid contained hyaluronic acid. Bilateral calcified pleural plaques are present.**
years 1968-76 the difference is significant ($x^2 = 7.58$, p<0.001 (table 5).

The age at which these cancers developed appeared to be lower than for mesothelioma and they appeared to be more frequent in men (who all smoked) than women (who did not) but these differences were not statistically significant (table 4). Examination of the lung biopsies for dust in the patients from the asbestos area showed numerous asbestos bodies (fig 4).

MINERALOGICAL INVESTIGATIONS

During earlier investigations the whitewash and stucco material had been examined at the State Institute of Mineralogical Research and shown by x-ray analysis to contain serpentine minerals and talc. It was assumed that the fibrous element was chrysotile because of the presence of the serpentine. On this occasion new samples of both whitewash or stucco from Čermik and lung material from the patient whose lung is shown in fig 4 were sent for more detailed analysis including electron microscopy and probe analysis of individual fibres.

The stucco was shown to consist of three non-fibrous phases—chlorite, talc, and a serpentine (antigorite/lizardite). The fibrous mineral was an amphibole, tremolite (fig 5). The serpentine mineral did not include chrysotile fibres. In the biopsy specimen most of the fibrous particles were tremolite with a very small percentage of chrysotile (fig 6). The elemental analyses of the fibres of tremolite in the stucco and the biopsy were found to be very similar, suggesting a common source.

Discussion

The use of stucco material containing a fibrous mineral appears to be the cause of the pleural reactions, pulmonary fibrosis, and malignant tumours of the lungs and pleura in the Čermik area. The inhabitants of Čermik and neighbouring communities are unaware that this material causes these diseases. While initial analysis suggested that the fibrous mineral was chrysotile,
more detailed analysis showed it to be the amphibole tremolite. The material also contains talc and non-fibrous serpentine but the detailed composition may vary from place to place within the area.

The material is quarried from the mountains by the male population both for local use and for sale elsewhere. It is used as a whitewash for the walls and floors of the houses. The application is usually done by women who grind the material to a powder and suspend it in water. The process is repeated each year. Consequently householders are repeatedly exposed from an early age, and this exposure can be described as both environmental and occupational but not industrial. The exposure leads to the diseases usually associated with exposure to asbestos.9-11 The first obvious sign is the development of "geographic" calcified plaques in the pleura.12-14 Radiographic changes of pulmonary fibrosis develop later in a proportion of the population as described by Meurman10 and Selikoff.11

In this environment the exposure is lifelong, from birth to death, as long as the individual remains in the area. Probably for this reason the radiographic changes appear early and are very extensive. We have encountered many cases of non-malignant pleural effusions associated with these changes similar to the cases described by Chretien16 and Lemannger.16 There is also thickening of the apical pleura in many cases which has not been described previously.

Although the prevalence of the non-malignant changes increases with age, it is variable in extent. Unless further study indicates wide variations in levels of exposure this suggests an inherent difference in susceptibility between individuals. The incidence of tuberculosis in this community is relatively low but further work is needed to see whether exposure to asbestos carries any protection against tuberculosis.

Individuals have been detected who spent their infancy in the asbestos area and then moved away. With no further exposure they have developed radiographic changes 20 to 25 years later and some have subsequently developed a respiratory neoplasm. This emphasises the relative importance of childhood exposure and of the long latent interval between critical exposure and the first detectable signs of disease. On the other hand adult exposure can also be significant as is exemplified by the wife of a government official who lived for only three years, from the age of 22 to 25 years, in Çermik and yet was found to have pleural calcification when she developed bronchial cancer 35 years later.

A similar clinical picture has been described in patients outside the areas of the present survey in Palu and Adiyaman to the North and West (fig 1). The population of the whole area which appears to be at risk is over half a million. So far the investigation covers about half the area and the numbers of people examined is only a small fraction of the total. Although support has been provided by the Tuberculosis Units of the Turkish Ministry of Health and Welfare it has only been possible to take radiographs of about 5% of the population at risk.

More important than the benign changes in the lungs and pleura are the related neoplasms. The malignant mesotheliomias are both the most frequent and most clearly related to asbestos exposure. This has been widely reported elsewhere.17-25 The bronchial cancers are not only slightly less frequent but only a proportion (perhaps one-third) can be attributed to the

Table 6 Results of radiological surveys

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Survey</th>
<th>Number of individuals</th>
<th>Pleural calcification Number</th>
<th>Pleural calcification %</th>
<th>Pulmonary fibrosis Number</th>
<th>Pulmonary fibrosis %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Previous studies</td>
<td>15 239</td>
<td>389</td>
<td>2.55</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>0.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This study</td>
<td>7000</td>
<td>461</td>
<td>6.50</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>1.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>22 239</td>
<td>850</td>
<td>3.82</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>0.69</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
asbestos exposure. Whereas mesotheliomas have been produced experimentally with asbestos fibres, it has been less easy to show that asbestos can cause primary bronchial cancers experimentally. In the case of both mesothelioma and bronchial cancer the relatively low frequency of these tumours in comparison with the benign changes suggests that individual susceptibility is also important.

As there is no effective treatment for these diseases it is imperative that efficient preventive measures are taken immediately. They should be aimed at protecting the whole population and not just the men while they quarry the material and the women while they apply the whitewash.

The work was carried out with the continuous help of Hamdi Acan MD, General Director of the Tuberculosis Unit, Ministry of Health and Welfare, Turkey. The special analysis of the stucco material and the dust in the lung biopsy was carried out by Dr FD Pooley, Department of Mineral Exploitation, University College, Cardiff, Wales.

References

Pleural calcification, pleural mesotheliomas, and bronchial cancers caused by tremolite dust.

S Yazicioglu, R Ilçayto, K Balci, B S Sayli and B Yorulmaz

*Thorax* 1980 35: 564-569
doi: 10.1136/thx.35.8.564

Updated information and services can be found at: [http://thorax.bmj.com/content/35/8/564](http://thorax.bmj.com/content/35/8/564)

These include:

**Email alerting service**

Receive free email alerts when new articles cite this article. Sign up in the box at the top right corner of the online article.

Notes

To request permissions go to: [http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions](http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions)

To order reprints go to: [http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform](http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform)

To subscribe to BMJ go to: [http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/](http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/)